Recruiting & Retaining Educators of Color: A Review of Research, Policy, and Practice

Terrenda White, PhD
Assistant Professor
University of Colorado-Boulder
Education Foundations, Policy, & Practice
Terrenda.White@colorado.edu
Twitter: terrenda1980
Research Background:

“Refusing to Leave Desegregation Behind: From Graduates of Racially Diverse Schools to the Supreme Court”

– Amy Stuart Wells, Jacquelyn Duran, & Terrenda White
– *Teachers College Record* Volume 110, Number 12, December 2008, pp. 2532–2570
– As an amici brief for the U.S. Supreme Court case, *Parents Involved*, regarding the Louisville and Seattle voluntary school desegregation cases, we analyze the long-term effects of attending racially diverse schools on their adult graduates, including interviews with graduates of desegregated schools in Louisville and Seattle.
– Despite how the ruling turned out—making it more difficult for district officials to racially balance their schools—the experience was very impactful on early experience as a researcher
Current Work:

• Has shifted toward **Strengthening Racial/Ethnic Diversity in Teaching:**
  
  – The White House Initiative on Educational Excellence, sponsored a recent webinar:
    
    “Recruiting & Retaining Educators of Color” (2015)
  

• How does a national teacher cohort model/fellowship improve effectiveness and retention of TOCs?

• Mixed-methods study; 129 teachers (53 TOCs, 76 white)
Current Work cont’d

• Recent Proposal to study:
  – “Intentionally Diverse Charter Schools: Reducing Inequality of Educational Opportunity Through Strategic Integration”
    • Priscilla Wohlstetter (Teachers College);
    • Terri Wilson, (CU-Boulder);
    • Terrenda White, (Cu-Boulder)

• *EdWeek* Series on Teacher Diversity – Ed. Blog
Why does Teacher Diversity Matter?
-How does it serve the goals of School Diversity?

Academic Impact

Socio-Emotional Impact

Business Rationale

Moral/Ethical Impact

Civil Rights Mandate

Shanker Institute:
http://www.shanker institute.org/resource/teacherdiversity
Academic Impact:

First priority must be to ensure that every student has the benefit of being taught by skilled, knowledgeable and caring teachers—of whatever race and ethnicity:

  - Found that a one-year same-race pairing of students and teachers significantly increased the math & reading test scores of both Black and White students by roughly 3-4 percentile points.

- Hanushek et al., 2005:
  - found that Black teachers were significantly more successful than White teachers in improving the reading and vocabulary scores of Black students.

- Clewell et al., 2005:
  - Found that test score gains in mathematics were significantly higher for Hispanic students taught by Hispanic teachers than for similar students taught by teachers of different ethnic backgrounds.
Academic Impact Cont’d

• Other studies show additional positive outcomes attributed to teacher diversity, same-race pairing:
  – Improvements for high school graduation rates of Black and Hispanic students,
  – Increased matriculation rate for Hispanic students,
  – Reduced Hispanic students’ dropout rates,
  – Lower number of Hispanic students assigned to special education,
  – Boosted Hispanic students’ placement in classes for the Gifted and Talented,
  – Decreased Hispanic students’ rates of suspension and expulsions,
  – Increased Black students’ enrollment in advanced math classes
Socio-Emotional & Cultural Impact

• **Role models** for *all* students; minority students in particular:
  – TOCs can help schools feel like a caring place for minority students. Serve as an extension of community; likely that students feel their home cultures are warmly embraced.

• In racially diverse schools, TOCs help to **alleviate sense of marginalization** students may feel in school (Cole, 1986; Graham, 1987; King, 1993).

• Teachers who have knowledge of children’s out-of-school lives and cultures are **less likely to confuse cultural difference** for cultural or **intellectual disadvantage** (Ladson-Billings, 1994, Noguera, 2008)

• High Expectations and “warm demander” relationship between teachers and students (Ware, 2006)
More Rationales

Reducing Implicit Bias/Racial Discrimination:

– Harvard and Yale (Paluck & Green, 2009) sought to understand what works to reduce prejudice. They concluded that experiments with cross-race contact and cooperation had yielded promising results.

– Another group of researchers (Plant et al., 2009) explored the “Obama Effect”:
  
  • Counter-stereotypic exposure to a Black authority figure can help to dramatically decrease levels of implicit, anti-Black prejudice and stereotyping.”
Review: Why Diversity Matters in the Teaching Force?

Research has confirmed that:

• Teachers of color are valuable **role models** for *all* students, and especially students of color (Quirocho & Rios, 2000)

• Teachers of color are often “**cultural brokers**” for students of color:
  – They tend to bring to teaching an understanding of students’ cultural backgrounds and experiences (Irvine, 1989; Achinstein et. al., 2008; see Villegas & Irvine, 2010).
  – They also bring to teaching personal experience with and insight into racism and ethnocentrism in society (see Miller & Endo, 2005; Quirocho & Rios, 2000 in Villegas & Lucas, 2012).

• Teachers of color have significant **impact on learning gains** for students of color
  – (see Egalite, Kisida, & Winters, 2015; Fairlie, Hoffman, & Oreopoulous, 2011; Dee, 2004)

• Teachers of color have significant impact on **other outcomes** for students, such as:
  – gifted and talented representation, attendance, AP enrollment, and college-going rates
  – (see Grissom et. al., 2015; Achinstein, et al., 2010; Villegas and Irvine, 2010)

• Teachers of color more often choose to work in “**hard-to-staff**” schools:
  – Minority teachers are two to three times more likely than white teachers to work in hard-to-staff schools, contributing to a segregated teaching force (Frakenberg, 2012) but due in part to TOC seeking out opportunities to work student in high-needs schools (see Achinstein et. al, 2010; Ingersoll and May, 2011).
National Trends in Teacher Diversity
Reasons for Lack of Diversity in Teaching:

**What we Know:**
There is chronic under-representation of teachers of color in U.S. schools, compared to an existing (and growing) population of students of color:

- Children of color\(^1\) in U.S. schools represent 47% (in 2015) (NCES)
- Teachers of color\(^1\) (TOC) in U.S. schools represent 17% (in 2015)

**White teachers, therefore, are ‘over-represented’:**
- White students in U.S. schools represent 49% (in 2015) (NCES)
- White teachers in U.S. schools represent 82% (in 2015)

Explanations for gap have focused on **demographics & pathways into teaching (the pipeline):**

1. Demographic changes - growth of students of color outpaced growth of teachers of color into profession
2. Teacher “shortage” - weak supply of TOC into the profession – due to weak recruitment, expanded professional options outside of education, or low pass rates among candidates of color on licensure exams

\(^1\)Students of Color include: Black/African American, Latino/a, Asian Pacific Islander, American Indian/Alaska Native

\(^1\)Teachers of Color include: Black/African American, Latino/a, Asian Pacific Islander, American Indian/Alaska Native
Recruitment as been successful, Retention not so much

**Efforts to improve the pathway into teaching have been innovative and comprehensive:**

1. **Financial incentives** (scholarships, loan forgiveness, bonuses)
2. Recruitment and support to transition paraprofessionals into teaching
3. Recruitment and support for 2year college students to transition to 4yr colleges w/ a focus on education
4. Pre-college initiatives (cadet programs) targeting high school students,
5. **Alternative certification programs** to target mid-career changers, returning peace corps volunteers, or non-education college graduates

**But explanations for the racial-gap have changed, and so too must policy interventions:**

- Indeed recruitment strategies targeting TOC have been largely successful. Yet recent data suggest that these efforts alone do not address the major source of the staffing problems and the under-representation of teachers of color — *teacher turnover*. (Ingersoll and May, 2011)
Effective Recruitment Efforts:

State policies for minority teacher recruitment have been successful, for the most part

- A total of 31 states have legislation geared for minority teacher recruitment – meaning candidates of color are explicitly targeted for recruitment into teaching.

Five types of recruitment strategies to diversify the teacher workforce:

1. **Financial incentives** – scholarships, loan forgiveness, etc.

2. **Creating government mandates** – an agency is required to take actions to support teacher diversity goals. They typically prepare a plan to recruit teachers of color, submit reports about progress, conduct studies about strategies, and identify the targeted needs within specific underrepresented groups. Agencies include: state commission of education, state board/department of education, professional standards commission, school district, district board of education, college/university

3. **Supporting specific types of recruitment programs** - pre-college/high school programs, 2-year college transition, and targeting paraprofessional to teach, returning peace corps volunteers

4. **Establishing recruitment centers**

5. **Alternate certification programs** as a pathway to teaching

---

2Based on Teacher Recruitment and Retention State Policy Database, created in 2005 by Learning Points Associates for the National Comprehensive Center for Teacher Quality (NCCTQ) – see Villegas and Lucas, 2012
TABLE 1
State Policies Supporting Minority Teacher Recruitment, 2010

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>States with Minority Teacher Recruitment Policies</th>
<th>AL, AK, AR, CA, CT, DE, FL, GA, IL, IN, IA, KS, KY, MA, MN, MO, NJ, NM, NY, NC, OK, OR, RI, SC, TN, TX, VT, VA, WA, WV, WI</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>31 of 50 states currently implement minority teacher policies.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Specific State Policy Strategies for Recruiting Minorities into Teaching

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Financial Incentives</th>
<th>AL, AK, AR, CA, CT, FL, IL, IN, IA, KS, KY, MA, MN, MO, NM, NC, OK, OR, SC, TN, VT, VA, WA, WV, WI (25 states)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Government Mandates</td>
<td>AL, AR, CT, DE, GA, IA, KY, MA, MN, MO, NY, OK, OR, RI, SC, TN, TX (17 states)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Specific State-Supported Recruitment Programs</td>
<td>AK, CA, FL, IL, KY, MA, MN, NC, SC, WA (10 states)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recruitment Center/Office</td>
<td>AK, AR, CT, NJ, OK, SC (6 states)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alternative Certification</td>
<td>CT, VA (2 states)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>States with No Policies Specific to Minority Teacher Recruitment</td>
<td>AZ, CO, HI, ID, LA, ME, MD, MI, MS, MT, NE, NV, NH, ND, OH, PA, SD, UT, WY (19 states)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

See Villegas & Lucas, 2012
States use several combinations of strategies for recruitment (Villegas et al, 2012):

— Twelve states use a single policy strategy (DE, GA, IN, KS, NJ, NM, NY, RI, TX, VT, WV, WI).

— Nineteen other states have adopted a policy package of two to four strategies.

— South Carolina has the most comprehensive policy package (including a government mandate, a specific recruitment program, financial incentives, and a recruitment center).

— Financial incentives and mandates seem to be the most frequent policy strategy – and the foundation of state policy initiatives to diversify the teaching force. All but one of the 31 states with a minority teacher recruitment policy (NJ) use one or both of these strategies.

**Alternative certification programs** are fast becoming a major strategy of recruitment
While Recruitment Efforts have been Successful, Retention has Not

- The representation of minority teachers—collectively—grew at a faster pace (92%) than that of their white counterparts (42%). For example:
  - Among minority teacher groups, Latino teachers had most growth (260% increase),
  - Teachers of Asian/Pacific Islander background had 2nd fastest growth (130% increase).
  - Black teachers increased by (27%), but their white, Latino, and Asian/Pacific Island peers outpaced them. As a result, Black teachers lost ground in their proportional representation within the overall teaching population. In 2007, Black teachers made up 7.0% of the overall teaching force, while in 1987 they accounted for a higher 8.2%.

- In other words: the total teaching population expanded over the years, with Latinos and Asians/Pacific Islanders with fast growth, and then Whites and Blacks with slower growths.

- As such, the proportional representation of teachers of color has risen, but not by a large percentage - from 13% in 1987 to 17% in 2007.
TABLE 2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Overall% Increase</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1987</td>
<td>92.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1993</td>
<td>42.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1999</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Comparison—Minority and White Groups

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Racial/Ethnic Group</th>
<th>1987</th>
<th>1993</th>
<th>1999</th>
<th>2007</th>
<th>Overall% Increase</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Minority</td>
<td>299,627</td>
<td>344,689</td>
<td>470,680</td>
<td>575,364</td>
<td>16.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>1,994,389</td>
<td>2,216,605</td>
<td>2,531,578</td>
<td>2,829,140</td>
<td>83.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Comparison—Minority Groups

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Racial/Ethnic Group</th>
<th>1987</th>
<th>1993</th>
<th>1999</th>
<th>2007</th>
<th>Overall% Increase</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Am. Ind./Alaska Native</td>
<td>23,998</td>
<td>20,064</td>
<td>25,869</td>
<td>17,023</td>
<td>0.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian/Pac. Is.</td>
<td>20,709</td>
<td>27,510</td>
<td>48,281</td>
<td>47,663</td>
<td>1.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black</td>
<td>187,836</td>
<td>188,371</td>
<td>227,505</td>
<td>238,316</td>
<td>7.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hispanic</td>
<td>67,084</td>
<td>108,744</td>
<td>169,025</td>
<td>241,721</td>
<td>7.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Two or more races</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>30,641</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


from Villegas, Strom, and Lucas, 2012
FIGURE NAT-2: PERCENT CHANGE IN STUDENTS AND TEACHERS, BY RACE AND ETHNICITY, 1987-88 TO 2007-08

(see “State of Teacher Diversity” report)
FIGURE NAT-4: OF DIFFERENT TYPES OF PUBLIC SCHOOLS, RACE AND ETHNICITY OF THEIR TEACHING STAFFS, 2011-2012
(see “State of Teacher Diversity” report)
Given the increase in # of TOCS, Why are they Chronically Under-Represented?

FIGURE NAT-5: PERCENT OF ANNUAL PUBLIC SCHOOL TEACHER TURNOVER, BY RACE AND ETHNICITY OF TEACHERS, BY YEAR

(see “State of Teacher Diversity” report)
Retention: A Renewed Focus for Education Leaders & Policymakers

“While there is still not parity between the proportions of minority students and minority teachers in schools, the teaching force has rapidly grown more diverse. This was also true for male minority teachers... Over the past 20 years, the number of white male teachers increased by only 18%, but the number of minority male teachers increased by 92%. Currently, males represent about 24% of white teachers and of minority teachers” (Ingersoll et. al., 2011, p. 63.)

“While minorities have entered teaching at higher rates than whites over the past two decades, minority teachers also have left schools at higher rates. ...In recent years, minority teachers were more likely to migrate from one school to another or to leave teaching altogether. This was especially true for male minority teachers.” (Ingersoll et. al., 2011, pg. 63)

“The data show that at the beginning of the 2003-04 school year, about 47,000 minority teachers entered teaching; however, by the following year, about 56,000 minority teachers had left teaching. These data convey an image of a revolving door: too many going in one door and out another.” (Ingersoll et. al., 2011, p. 64)
The number of black teachers has dropped in nine U.S. cities (see “State of Teacher Diversity” report)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CITY</th>
<th>OVERALL</th>
<th>WHITE TEACHERS</th>
<th>BLACK TEACHERS</th>
<th>HISPANIC TEACHERS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BOSTON</td>
<td>-3.3</td>
<td>-0.8</td>
<td>-18.3</td>
<td>+1.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHICAGO</td>
<td>-13.4</td>
<td>-3.2</td>
<td>-39.2</td>
<td>+6.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CLEVELAND</td>
<td>-17.4</td>
<td>-12.0</td>
<td>-33.9</td>
<td>-9.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LOS ANGELES</td>
<td>-16.9</td>
<td>-28.0</td>
<td>-33.2</td>
<td>+6.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NEW ORLEANS</td>
<td>-44.4</td>
<td>+3.3</td>
<td>-62.3</td>
<td>+43.5**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NEW YORK CITY</td>
<td>-2.0</td>
<td>-1.9</td>
<td>-15.1</td>
<td>+2.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PHILADELPHIA</td>
<td>+12.7**</td>
<td>+26.8</td>
<td>-18.5</td>
<td>+26.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAN FRANCISCO</td>
<td>-11.9</td>
<td>-21.9</td>
<td>-32.4</td>
<td>+8.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Teacher Diversity in Washington, D.C., Public Schools has declined significantly:

(see “State of Teacher Diversity” report)
While declines are related to Federal, State, and City Policies and Politics – Districts and Schools Play a Role!

FIGURE NAT-6: PERCENT OF MINORITY PUBLIC SCHOOL TEACHERS REPORTING GENERAL TYPES OF REASONS FOR THEIR TURNOVER, 2012-2013
(see “State of Teacher Diversity” report)
FIGURE NAT-7: OF THOSE MINORITY PUBLIC SCHOOL TEACHERS REPORTING DISSATISFACTION, PERCENT REPORTING PARTICULAR REASONS FOR THEIR TURNOVER, 2012-2013

(see “State of Teacher Diversity” report)
Sources of Attrition Among Educators of Color

“Non-policy” related sources of attrition include:
1. Retirement
2. Competitive job opportunities in other professions
3. Personal reasons and family-related decisions

“Policy-Related” Sources of Attrition for Teachers of Color:
1. **Student Characteristics**
   – Previous studies suggested that teachers leave schools with high numbers of low-income children to work in schools serving more affluent students
   – *This theory, however, does not fit with the attrition patterns of teachers of color; and has also been challenged more recently for white educators* (see Simon & Johnson, 2015)

2. **Working Conditions** shape voluntary departures
   – Organizational factors and school working conditions are a primary issue identified by departing teachers (see Ingersoll & May, 2011)

3. **Accountability Mandates & Sanctions** shape involuntary departures
   – ‘hard-to-staff’ schools, where teachers of color more often work, face sanctions and punitive accountability mandates – less studied, needed research (Lipman et. al., 2014; Weber et. al., 2014).
Recommendations for Policy & National Leaders Committed to a Diverse Workforce

1. Encourage more States to adopt recruitment legislation, targeting TOCs

2. Encourage existing States to develop more comprehensive plans, utilizing a variety of strategies, including: financial incentives, government mandates, recruitment centers, special programs (e.g. pre-college programs), and alternative certification programs targeting mid-career, paraprofessionals.

3. Invest significantly more support for retention efforts, including both ‘voluntary’ and “involuntary” sources of attrition:
   - Efforts to minimize voluntary attrition should focus on management, leadership, and working conditions in schools that impact teacher autonomy and decision-making.
   - Efforts to minimize involuntary sources of attrition should focus on the disparate and adverse impact of accountability policies, school closings, and reconstitution plans on teachers of color who more often work in schools targeted for intervention.

4. Leverage research to support the protection of teachers’ civil rights and professional authority – connected to pending class action lawsuits by veteran educators of color fired en mass in urban cities like New Orleans, as well as political debates about teacher unionism and collective bargaining rights.
Examples of Positive Initiatives:

• New York City District Initiative
• Pathways2Teaching
• Call Me MISTER
• Grow Your Own Teachers
• Minority Teacher Identification and Enrichment Program
• Teacher Quality and Retention Program
• Teach Tomorrow in Oakland
• Today’s Students, Tomorrow’s Teachers
• Urban Teacher Enhancement Program
NYC & Mayor Bill de Blasio

• Through the Department of Education and Mayor Bill de Blasio's Young Men's Initiative, the City is setting out to recruit an additional 1,000 Black, Latino and Asian men by 2018 to enroll in teacher certification programs.

• The Department of Education has already established a strong partnership with the City University of New York to recruit graduates from teacher preparation programs, with 35% of this past year's NYC Teaching Fellows being people of color.
Pathways 2 Teaching  
(High School Cadet Program)

The Pathways2Teaching program is designed to encourage high school students of color to explore the teaching profession as a viable career choice by viewing the work of teachers as an act of social justice. In other words, the teaching profession is presented as an opportunity for engaging with, giving back to, and disrupting educational inequities in and for their communities. The curriculum has an explicit focus on preparing students for college through rigorous coursework and experiences that foster students' abilities to analyze, synthesize, and critically evaluate a range of complex issues that exist in poor communities - the very challenges experienced by many of our students.

-Margarita Bianco, Director  
(Professor in the School of Education & Human Development at University of Colorado Denver. Founder, Executive Director of Pathways2Teaching)
Call Me MISTER program

Call Me MISTER is focused on diversifying the teaching field by recruiting, training, and empowering transformative Black male educators. Since its inception in 2000 at Clemson University, the program has provided a resounding answer to the question "where are the Black male teachers?" by introducing young Black men to the classroom at early stages and training them to become not just traditional teachers, but transformative role models inside and outside of the classroom.

Emmanuel Little is the director of the Call Me MISTER program and minority retention at Georgia College.
References:

6. Feistritzer, Emily. (2005). Profile of Alternative Route Teachers of Color; National Center For Education Information